

CHAPTER 41

SPECIAL ISSUES OF WOMEN PRISONERS*

A. An Overview of Women in the Criminal Justice System

Over 200,000 women are imprisoned in the United States, a number that has grown more than 800% over the past thirty years.¹ By comparison, the male prison population grew by 416% over the same time period.² Rates of incarceration for women vary significantly by region. Oklahoma has the highest female imprisonment rate at 134 per 100,000 women, and Massachusetts has the lowest at 13 per 100,000 women.³

More women than ever before are currently in prison as a result of drug offenses. From 1999 to 2008, arrests of women for drug violations increased by 19% compared to just a 10% increase for men.⁴ Furthermore, female prisoners are more likely than male prisoners to have histories of physical or sexual abuse.⁵ As of 2004, 73% of women in state prisons, compared to 55% of men, had suffered symptoms of mental illness and/or received treatment from a mental health professional within the previous year.⁶

This Chapter explains the unique concerns and legal rights of women prisoners. Prison can be a very different experience for women than it is for men, and for this reason it is important that female prisoners be given the opportunity to learn about issues that specifically affect them. However, since many of your concerns as a prisoner affect both men and women, you should always read any relevant parts of the *JLM* that may apply to your situation in addition to the relevant sections in this Chapter.

This Chapter is divided into six parts, A to F. Part A provides statistics on women in the criminal justice system and a brief overview of what topics will be covered in this Chapter. Part B describes the issue of equal protection in programs and services provided to both male and female prisoners. Part C supplements Chapter 23 of the *JLM*, “Your Right to Adequate Medical Care,” and focuses on medical care for women prisoners, including the right to basic gynecological care, abortions, treatment for HIV, and resources and treatment for pregnant women. For general information about the rights of imprisoned parents, please see Chapter 33 of the *JLM*, “Rights of Incarcerated Parents.” Part D focuses on privacy concerns, searches, sexual harassment, and sexual assault and rape. Your right to be free from assaults and illegal body searches is also described in *JLM*, Chapter 24, “Your Right to be Free from Assault by Prison Guards and Other Prisoners,” and Chapter 25, “Your Right to Be Free from Illegal Body Searches.” Part E discusses the growing popularity of alternative sentencing options such as drug treatment programs, and explains why programs designed for men may not be as effective for women. Part F defines and explains a form of sentencing adjustment called “clemency,” a description of clemency proceedings and how you can petition for clemency as a battered woman. While Part G focuses on clemency for battered women, any person

* This Chapter is based on previous versions by Rena Stern, Michelle Maloney, Rachel Wilgoren, Melissa Rothstein, and Shelley Inglis. Special thanks to Y. Rupa Rao and Lisa Freeman.

1. Women’s Prison Association Institute on Women and Criminal Justice, *Quick Facts: Women and Criminal Justice 2009* (Sept. 2009), available at http://66.29.139.159/pdf/Quick%20Facts%20Women%20and%20CJ_Sept09.pdf (last visited Aug. 10, 2012).

2. Women’s Prison Association Institute on Women and Criminal Justice, *Quick Facts: Women and Criminal Justice 2009* (Aug. 2010), available at http://66.29.139.159/pdf/Quick%20Facts%20Women%20and%20CJ_Sept09.pdf (last visited Aug. 25, 2012).

3. Women’s Prison Association Institute on Women and Criminal Justice, *Quick Facts: Women and Criminal Justice 2009* (Sept. 2009), available at http://66.29.139.159/pdf/Quick%20Facts%20Women%20and%20CJ_Sept09.pdf (last visited Aug. 10, 2012).

4. Women’s Prison Association Institute on Women and Criminal Justice, *Quick Facts: Women and Criminal Justice 2009* (Sept. 2009), available at http://66.29.139.159/pdf/Quick%20Facts%20Women%20and%20CJ_Sept09.pdf (last visited Aug. 10, 2012).

5. Women in Prison Project, Correctional Association of New York, *Women in Prison Fact Sheet* (Apr. 2009), available at http://www.correctionalassociation.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Wome_in_Prison_Fact_Sheet_2009_FINAL.pdf (last visited Aug. 10, 2012).

6. Women in Prison Project, Correctional Association of New York, *Women in Prison Fact Sheet* (Apr. 2009), available at http://www.correctionalassociation.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Wome_in_Prison_Fact_Sheet_2009_FINAL.pdf (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

petitioning for clemency can use these procedures. Other possibilities for release are discussed in *JLM*, Chapter 34, “Temporary Release Programs,” Chapter 35, “Getting out Early: Conditional & Early Release,” and Chapter 36, “Parole.”

B. Equal Protection and Programming

Many prison programs fail to address issues that are specific to female prisoners because the majority of the prison population is usually male. Nonetheless, being smaller in number is not a reason to be discriminated against, and women prisoners should know that in many situations, they have the right to seek programs and services substantially equivalent to the ones offered to males.

If you feel that you have been unfairly discriminated against, there are two different steps you can take depending on the type of discrimination you think you are experiencing. If the discrimination concerns vocational and educational programs in prison, a claim may be brought under a federal law called Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972.⁷ Otherwise, a challenge can be brought under the Equal Protection Clause of federal and state constitutions. Each type of action will be explained below.⁸ To win on an equal protection challenge, you must:

- (1) demonstrate that male and female prisoners are “similarly situated,” and
- (2) that the only reason you received different treatment was because of your gender.⁹

“Similarly situated” means that two groups in the situation at hand are the same in all major ways except for their gender, making the difference in treatment discrimination based on sex. However, proving the above may not be enough to win the challenge, since prisons are actually allowed to discriminate between similarly situated male and female prisoners if the differing treatment has a “fair and substantial relationship to achievement of the State’s correctional objectives.”¹⁰ This means that the prison can treat men and women differently if the different treatment is substantially related to the prison’s goals, such as safety and security. For more information on how to make a claim under the Equal Protection Clause, read *JLM*, Chapter 16(g), “Fourteenth Amendment Claims: The Equal Protection Clause.”

As mentioned above, if you feel that your institution does not provide the same vocational and educational programs as the men’s prisons, you can bring a discrimination claim under a federal law called Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972.¹¹ Title IX states that “[n]o person . . . shall, on the basis of sex, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any education program or activity receiving federal financial assistance.”¹² Thus, for example, if you know that the men’s prison has a college program, and the women’s prison does not, you might have a Title IX claim. Equally, if you are aware that the men’s prison has an athletics or sports program, and the women’s prison does not, you might also have a Title IX claim.

In brief, to win a Title IX claim you must be able to prove that you were, while in prison, “on the basis of sex . . . excluded from participat[ing] in, . . . denied the benefits of, or . . . subjected to discrimination

7. 20 U.S.C. § 1681 (1972).

8. *Clarkson v. Coughlin*, 898 F. Supp. 1019, 1043 (S.D.N.Y. 1995) (holding that providing a Sensorially Disabled Unit for men but not women violated equal protection); *West v. Virginia Dept. of Corr.*, 847 F. Supp. 402, 407–09 (W.D. Va. 1994) (holding failure to provide boot camp programs for women as well as men violated equal protection); *Casey v. Lewis*, 834 F. Supp. 1477, 1550–51 (D. Ariz. 1993) (holding inequalities in mental health treatment violated equal protection); *McCoy v. Nevada Dept. of Prisons*, 776 F. Supp. 521, 523 (D. Nev. 1991); *Glover v. Johnson*, 721 F. Supp. 808, 848–49 (E.D. Mich. 1989) (explaining “parity” in more detail), *aff’d in part and rev’d in part on other grounds*, 934 F.2d 703 (6th Cir. 1991); *Canterino v. Wilson*, 546 F. Supp. 174, 210–12 (W.D. Ky. 1982), *vacated and remanded on other grounds*, 869 F.2d 948 (6th Cir. 1989).

9. *See Reed v. Reed*, 404 U.S. 71, 75, 92 S. Ct. 251, 253, L. Ed. 2d 225, 229 (1971) (holding that a statute cannot express a preference for males to be estate administrators).

10. *Glover v. Johnson*, 478 F. Supp. 1075, 1079 (E.D. Mich. 1979) (finding that vocational programs for women lacked parity with the programs for men, denying equal protection); see also *Roubideaux v. North Dakota Dept. of Corrections and Rehabilitation*, 570 F.3d 966, 974–75 (8th Cir. 2009) (finding no equal protection violation where some female prisoners, but no males, were placed in county jails with more limited programming, because statutes related to an important government objective); *Smith v. Bingham*, 914 F.2d 740, 742 (5th Cir. 1990) (male prisoner working as a writ-writer at women’s prison need not be permitted to enroll in women’s vocational programs; separation of sexes had a “substantial relationship” to important security objectives).

11. 20 U.S.C. § 1681 (1972).

12. 20 U.S.C. § 1681(a) (1972).

under any education program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance.”¹³ Specifically, recipients of federal financial assistance such as your prison are prohibited from (1) treating the genders differently in determining eligibility for programs; (2) providing “different aid, benefits, or services or provid[ing] aid, benefits, or services in a different manner”; (3) denying anyone “aid, benefits or services”; and (4) subjecting anyone “to separate or different rules of behavior, sanctions or other treatment.”¹⁴ If you have reason to believe that your prison is engaging in any of the above actions than you might have a good claim.

It may also be easier to win a Title IX claim than an Equal Protection claim. One reason for this is that in Title IX claims, you do not have to show that the two groups are “similarly situated.” Courts have found that federal law already assumes that male and female participants in federally-funded educational programs are similarly situated¹⁵ and thus entitled to the same opportunities and programs. Also, even if a rule that discriminates against women has a “fair and substantial relationship to achievement of the State’s correctional objectives” (which would cause you to lose on an Equal Protection claim), that does not automatically mean you will lose on your Title IX claim.¹⁶ For Title IX claims, whether the discrimination is “reasonably related” to a legitimate prison interest is only one of the factors courts consider when deciding whether it is legal.¹⁷ Other factors include: whether the prison has a legitimate security interest in providing very different educational opportunities to men than to women, and cost and management concerns.¹⁸

For example, in *Jeldness v. Pearce*, female prisoners sued their prison because, while male prisoners could choose from twelve vocational classes, female prisoners could only choose from two. While the prison officials said the difference in class numbers was due to a “legitimate penological interest” (a justifiable interest of the prison) because the male prison population was bigger, the court said that this by itself did not prevent the women’s claim.¹⁹ The court decided that the female prisoners were entitled to equal opportunities to the male prisoners. Although equal opportunity was not defined as meaning being entitled to the same number of classes, it was decided that women are entitled to the same diversity of classes as well as access to some of the male classes.²⁰

C. Adequate Medical Care

Both male and female prisoners have the right to adequate medical care, as explained in Chapter 23 of the *JLM*, “Your Right to Adequate Medical Care.” This Section addresses medical needs specific to imprisoned women. Therefore, you should be sure to read Chapter 23 for any concerns you have regarding your right to medical care that may be relevant to both men and women. Research has shown that female prisoners have different, and often more severe, health problems than male prisoners.²¹ Many women prisoners suffer from chronic and complex health conditions resulting from lives of poverty, drug use, family

13. 20 U.S.C. § 1681(a) (1972).

14. 45 C.F.R. § 86.31(b).

15. See *Klinger v. Dept. of Corr.*, 107 F.3d 609, 614 (8th Cir. 1997).

16. *Clarkson v. Coughlin*, 898 F. Supp. 1019, 1043 (S.D.N.Y. 1995) (holding that provision of a Sensorially Disabled Unit for men but not women denied equal protection); *West v. Virginia Dept. of Corr.*, 847 F. Supp. 402, 407–09 (W.D. Va. 1994) (holding failure to provide boot camp programs for women as well as men denied equal protection); *Casey v. Lewis*, 834 F. Supp. 1477, 1550–51 (D. Ariz. 1993) (holding inequalities in mental health treatment denied equal protection); *McCoy v. Nevada Dept. of Prisons*, 776 F. Supp. 521, 523 (D. Nev. 1991); *Glover v. Johnson*, 721 F. Supp. 808, 848–49 (E.D. Mich. 1989) (explaining “parity” in more detail), *aff’d in part and rev’d in part on other grounds*, 934 F.2d 703 (6th Cir. 1991); *Canterino v. Wilson*, 546 F. Supp. 174, 210–12 (W.D. Ky. 1982), *vacated and remanded on other grounds*, 869 F.2d 948 (6th Cir. 1989).

17. *Jeldness v. Pearce*, 30 F.3d 1220, 1230 (9th Cir. 1984).

18. *Jeldness v. Pearce*, 30 F.3d 1220, 1230 (9th Cir. 1984).

19. *Jeldness v. Pearce*, 30 F.3d 1220, 1224, 1230 (9th Cir. 1984).

20. *Jeldness v. Pearce*, 30 F.3d 1220, 1229 (9th Cir. 1984).

21. According to the World Health Organization, “Women in prison often have more health problems than male prisoners. . . . Women’s prisons require a gender specific framework for health care which pays special attention for reproductive health, mental illness, substance use problems and physical and sexual abuse. Timely access to all services available for women outside prison, should be available for women inside prison. As with all prisoners, confidentiality of medical records should always be guaranteed.” World Health Organization Europe, World Health Organization Conference on Women’s Health in Prison, *Correcting Gender Inequities in Prison Health*, Consultative document for discussion at the WHO International Conference on Prison Health, 15 (Nov. 2008), available at http://synthesis.womenshealthdata.ca/uploads/topic226_0.pdf (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

violence, sexual assault, adolescent pregnancy, malnutrition, and poor health care.²² Women prisoners also suffer from mental illness at higher rates than male prisoners. As of January 2007, more than 42% of women in New York's prisons had been diagnosed with a serious mental illness, compared to nearly 12% of male prisoners.²³ The prison environment does not always take into account women's specific health needs. For example, prisons often do not provide accessible hygiene products during menstruation, adequate nutrition for pregnant women, or specialized care for women who are infected with diseases like HIV/AIDS.²⁴

1. Eighth Amendment Claim for Adequate Medical Care

You have a federal right under the Eighth Amendment to receive adequate medical care for serious medical needs.²⁵ For information on bringing a claim that your Eighth Amendment rights were violated, see *JLM*, Chapter 16, "Using 42 U.S.C. 1983 and 28 U.S.C. 1331 to Obtain Relief from Violations of Federal Law." Generally, to make an Eighth Amendment claim, you must show that:

- (1) The prison official's action or failure to act put you at a *substantial risk of serious harm*;²⁶ and that
- (2) The prison official knew about the seriousness of your condition and exhibited *deliberate indifference* to your medical needs.²⁷

"Deliberate indifference" means that the prison official had some idea of the seriousness of your medical condition and still did not provide you with necessary care.²⁸ A court may find "deliberate indifference" where a prison has a "pattern or practice" of providing less than adequate medical services and facilities to its inmates over a long period of time.²⁹

As a female prisoner, you have a right to adequate gynecological care and general physical examinations.³⁰ In 1977, female prisoners at Bedford Hills Correctional Facility, New York's maximum-security prison for women, brought a lawsuit against the facility alleging an unconstitutionally defective medical care system.³¹ The prisoners argued that the prison failed to provide gynecological and general physical examinations when the prisoners were first admitted, and did not provide proper follow-up care and recordkeeping.³² The Second Circuit Court of Appeals found that extremely long delays and outright denial of medical care violated the female prisoners' constitutional rights.³³

22. World Health Organization Europe, World Health Organization Conference on Women's Health in Prison, *Correcting Gender Inequities in Prison Health*, Consultative document for discussion at the WHO International Conference on Prison Health, 15 (Nov. 2008), available at http://synthesis.womenshealthdata.ca/uploads/topic226_0.pdf (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

23. Women in Prison Project, Correctional Association of New York, *Women in Prison Fact Sheet* (Apr. 2009), available at <http://www.correctionalassociation.org/resource/women-in-prison-fact-sheet> (last visited Aug. 25, 2012).

24. World Health Organization Europe, World Health Organization Conference on Women's Health in Prison, *Correcting Gender Inequities in Prison Health*, Consultative document for discussion at the WHO International Conference on Prison Health, 15 (Nov. 2008), available at http://synthesis.womenshealthdata.ca/uploads/topic226_0.pdf (last visited Aug. 14, 2012).

25. *Estelle v. Gamble*, 429 U.S. 97, 104, 97 S. Ct. 285, 291, 50 L. Ed. 2d 251, 260 (1976).

26. *Helling v. McKinney*, 509 U.S. 25, 35, 113 S. Ct. 2475, 2481, 125 L. Ed. 2d 22 (1993). "Sufficiently serious" means that your future health has been unreasonably endangered, and that it is contrary to current standards of decency for you to be kept under such conditions.

27. *Farmer v. Brennan*, 511 U.S. 825, 834, 114 S. Ct. 1970, 1977, 128 L. Ed. 2d 811, 824 (1994); *Estelle v. Gamble*, 429 U.S. 97, 104, 97 S. Ct. 285, 291, 50 L. Ed. 2d 251, 260 (1976).

28. *Estelle v. Gamble*, 429 U.S. 97, 104, 97 S. Ct. 285, 291, 50 L. Ed. 2d 251, 260 (1976).

29. See, e.g., *Todaro v. Ward*, 565 F.2d 48 (2d Cir. 1977) (finding that a prison's medical care violated the Eighth Amendment because of inadequate access to medical staff, the use of a "lobby clinic" for screening complaints, and record-keeping procedures that caused substantial delays).

30. *Todaro v. Ward*, 431 F. Supp. 1129, 1131 (S.D.N.Y. 1977), *aff'd*, 565 F.2d 48 (2d Cir. 1977).

31. *Todaro v. Ward*, 431 F. Supp. 1129, 1131 (S.D.N.Y. 1977), *aff'd*, 565 F.2d 48 (2d Cir. 1977).

32. *Todaro v. Ward*, 431 F. Supp. 1129, 1137, 1145-47 (S.D.N.Y. 1977).

33. *Todaro v. Ward*, 565 F.2d 48, 53 (2d Cir. 1977). The court appointed a monitor to make sure that the prison complied with the improvements ordered by the court. In August 2002, the court's monitor found that after 20 years, Bedford Hills had finally complied with the court's judgment, which included providing gynecological care and infectious disease care for women with HIV/AIDS. By agreement with the State of New York, the Prisoners' Rights Project of the Legal Aid Society continued monitoring the Facility until August 2004 to ensure that reforms were institutionalized.

Although the Eighth Amendment requires you to show “deliberate indifference,” state tort law often only requires you to show that the doctor or prison official was *negligent*. Negligent medical care means that the care is below the standard that a reasonable member of the profession would give. To find out the specific requirement in your state, consult Chapter 2 of the *JLM*, “Introduction to Legal Research.”

2. Steps you can take if you are concerned about the level of medical care provided in your prison

If you are concerned about the level of medical care that is provided in your prison, there are five possible steps you can take:

- (1) The first thing you should do is consult your institution’s administrative grievance procedure. You should attempt to resolve your concerns following your institution’s procedure before taking your concerns to court (see Chapter 15 of the *JLM*, “Inmate Grievance Procedures”).
- (2) Only if you have “exhausted” (used up) all of your administrative remedies without success should you consider filing a claim in court.
- (3) If you think that prison officials have been “deliberately indifferent” towards your medical needs, you may want to pursue a claim that your Eighth Amendment rights were violated (see *JLM*, Chapter 16, Using 42 U.S.C. 1983 and 28 U.S.C. 1331 to Obtain Relief From Violations of Federal Law).
- (4) If you think that officials were just negligent (careless) towards you, you may want to file a tort action in a state court (or in the Court of Claims, if you are in New York).
- (5) If you are trying to get the prison to provide you with specific medical care, rather than monetary damages, you may want to file an Article 78 petition in state court (if you are in New York).

See Chapter 23 of the *JLM*, “Your Right to Adequate Medical Care,” and Chapter 5, “Choosing a Court & a Lawsuit: An Overview of the Options,” for more information on choosing your claim and your court.

(a) Accessing Medical Care

Chapter 26 of the *JLM*, “Infectious Diseases (AIDS, Hepatitis, and Tuberculosis) in Prison,” has information for prisoners who already have an infectious disease (like HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, hepatitis B, hepatitis C, or MRSA), as well as prisoners who want to avoid getting an infectious disease. Prisoners should receive a medical examination shortly after arriving in prison.³⁴ As part of this initial exam, prisoners should be tested for sexually transmitted diseases (STDs) and tuberculosis (TB). Some courts have ruled that prisons must perform tests to check for these and other infectious diseases.³⁵ Unfortunately, despite the duty of prisons to conduct such exams, many women prisoners do not receive a medical exam after being admitted.³⁶

In addition to an initial exam, prisoners should receive check-ups and diagnostic tests.³⁷ A federal district court in Washington DC found, in *Women Prisoners v. District of Columbia*, that the Department of Corrections failed to meet the general standard of adequate medical care because of poor gynecological examinations and testing, inadequate testing for sexually transmitted diseases, and insufficient follow-up care, among other problems.³⁸

34. See 28 C.F.R. § 522.20 (2010) (requiring Bureau of Prisons staff to screen all newly arrived prisoners to ensure that federal health standards are met). In New York, the applicable law is N.Y. Comp. Codes R. & Regs. tit. 9, § 7010.1 (2010), which states that “prompt screening is essential to identify serious or life-threatening medical conditions requiring immediate evaluation and treatment.”

35. See, e.g., *Laureau v. Manson*, 651 F.2d 96, 109 (2d Cir. 1981) (concluding that lack of screening for infectious diseases resulted in serious threat to prisoners’ well-being); *Feliciano v. Gonzalez*, 13 F. Supp. 2d 151 (D.P.R. 1998) (finding failure to screen incoming prisoners for infectious diseases, including TB, to be unconstitutional); *Inmates of Occoquan v. Barry*, 717 F. Supp. 854, 867 (D.D.C. 1989) (finding lack of syphilis and TB testing to be one of the systemic failures showing deliberate indifference).

36. See National Commission on Correctional Health Care, *Women’s Health Care in Correctional Settings*, (Oct. 2005), available at <http://www.ncchc.org/resources/statements/womenshealth2005.html> (last visited Aug. 15, 2012).

37. *Women Prisoners v. Dist. of Columbia*, 877 F. Supp. 634, 667–68 (D.D.C. 1994), *vacated and modified in part on other grounds*, 899 F.Supp. 659 (D.D.C. 1995).

38. *Women Prisoners v. Dist. of Columbia*, 877 F. Supp. 634, 667–68 (D.D.C. 1994), *vacated and modified in part on other grounds*, 899 F.Supp. 659 (D.D.C. 1995).

To learn more about your rights, you should consult your institution's regulations regarding medical care, as well as the relevant codes in federal or state law. For New York, the regulations governing health care for prisoners may be found in Parts 7010 and 7651 of Title 9 (Executive) of the Codes, Rules and Regulations.³⁹

Your institution or the corrections department in your state may not have such regulations. If this is the case, you should find out if your institution has a manual that explains health care provisions, or if the department of corrections in your state has an operations manual. For example, in Texas each correctional facility is required to have a written Health Services Plan, which should provide procedures for regularly scheduled sick calls, emergency services, long-term care, and other medical services.⁴⁰ In California, health care provisions are found in the Department Operations Manual of the California Department of Corrections.⁴¹

3. Abortion

(a) Your Right to Choose: Access to Elective Abortions

An 'elective' abortion is the voluntary termination of a pregnancy, where a woman personally chooses to have her pregnancy ended for non-emergency reasons. You do not lose your legal right to decide whether to continue a pregnancy or to have an elective abortion just because you are in prison.⁴² However, states are allowed to place restrictions or limitations on a woman's right to an abortion, like requiring parental consent for minors, as long as they do not place an "undue burden" on a woman's right to choose.⁴³ An undue burden exists, and therefore a provision of law is invalid, if its purpose or effect is to place substantial obstacles in the path of a woman seeking an abortion before the fetus attains viability.⁴⁴ Courts decide what kind of obstacles might count as an "undue burden." Prisons and jails sometimes have regulations that make it difficult to obtain an abortion, so if you think you could be pregnant and might want an abortion, you should get a pregnancy test as soon as possible by contacting your prison's medical center.

There are two main types of prison policies that have been challenged in the courts:⁴⁵

- (1) Blanket prohibitions that explicitly prohibit transporting prisoners off prison grounds in order to get abortions (assuming the abortion is not medically necessary);⁴⁶ and
- (2) Court order provisions that require female prisoners to get a court order before they can get an abortion.⁴⁷

In both of these kinds of cases, courts have relied on the Supreme Court's "reasonableness" standard as set forth in *Turner v. Safley*, to decide whether the challenged policies violated a woman's right to an abortion under the Fourteenth Amendment.⁴⁸ *Turner* also stated that prison regulations that restrict the rights of prisoners must be substantially related to some legitimate (justified) concern of the prison, where it

39. N.Y. Comp. Codes R. & Reg. tit. 9, § 7651.1, *et. seq.* (2010).

40. 37 Tex. Admin. Code § 273.2 (West 2010).

41. California Department of Corrections and Rehabilitation, Department Operation Manual, "Chapter 9- Health Care Services" (Jan. 2009), available at http://www.cdcr.ca.gov/Regulations/Adult_Operations/docs/DOM/DOM%202012/2012%20DOM-Combined.pdf (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

42. See *Roe v. Crawford*, 514 F.3d 789 (8th Cir. 2008); *Victoria W. v. Larpenter*, 369 F.3d 475 (5th Cir. 2004); *Bryant v. Maffucci*, 923 F.2d 979 (1991); *Monmouth County Corr. Institutional Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326 (3d Cir. 1987); *Doe v. Barron*, 92 F. Supp. 2d 694 (S.D. Ohio 1999); *Doe v. Arpaio*, 150 P.3d 1258 (Ariz. Ct. App. 2007).

43. See *Planned Parenthood v. Casey*, 505 U.S. 833, 876-77, 112 S. Ct. 2791, 2820-21, 120 L. Ed. 2d 674, 714 (1992).

44. See *Planned Parenthood v. Casey*, 505 U.S. 833, 837, 112 S. Ct. 2791, 2820-21, 120 L. Ed. 2d 674, 714 (1992).

45. For summary and analysis of these cases, see Diana Kasdan, *Abortion Access for Incarcerated Women: Are Correctional Health Practices in Conflict with Constitutional Standards?*, 41 *Perspectives on Sexual and Reproductive Health* 1, 59 (Mar. 2009), available at <http://www.guttmacher.org/pubs/psrh/full/4105909.pdf> (last visited Jan. 25, 2010). See also *Prisoner Procreation and Abortion Issues*, 2007 (11) *AELE Monthly Law Journal* 301, 304-308 (Nov. 2007), available at <http://www.aele.org/law/2007JBNOV/2007-11MLJ301.pdf> (last visited Oct. 29, 2012).

46. See *Roe v. Crawford*, 514 F.3d 789 (8th Cir. 2008).

47. See *Monmouth County Corr. Inst'l Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326 (3d Cir. 1987), *Doe v. Arpaio*, 150 P.3d 1258 (Ariz. Ct. App. 2007).

48. *Turner v. Safley*, 482 U.S. 78, 87, 107 S. Ct. 2254, 2261, 96 L. Ed. 2d 64, 78 (1987).

was held that restrictions on the right to marry between prisoners and civilians were not reasonably related to any prison objective.⁴⁹

When considering whether prison policies are unreasonable in light of blanket prohibitions and court order provisions, courts take into account a range of concerns including the safety risk of transporting prisoners off prison grounds, and the need to allocate scarce resources and time.⁵⁰ To show that it is unreasonable to refuse to transport women to clinics or hospitals for an abortion, courts have cited the prison's ability to provide transportation for other kinds of pregnancy care.⁵¹ For example, as the Third Circuit explained in *Monmouth*, prisons already have to provide all pregnant prisoners with proper pre-natal and post-natal care, which requires the same resources as taking a prisoner to get an abortion.⁵² The *Monmouth* court further found that prison officials must provide abortion services even if the prisoner cannot pay for them.⁵³

In New York, abortions are only legal if they are performed in the first twenty-four weeks of the pregnancy, except if they are medically necessary to save the mother's life.⁵⁴ In the Second Circuit case of *Bryant v. Maffucci*, the prison took so long to schedule the prisoner's abortion that the twenty four week deadline had passed and she was unable to get an abortion.⁵⁵ The court found that the prison officials had not violated the Eighth Amendment because they were "merely negligent," rather than "deliberately indifferent" to the prisoner's need for an abortion (see above for definitions of these terms).⁵⁶

The Third Circuit, which covers Delaware, New Jersey, and Pennsylvania, has recognized that the denial of elective abortions is a serious medical need, and will have "irreparable" physical and emotional consequences for prisoners who do not want to carry their pregnancy to term.⁵⁷ However, other courts have not followed the Third Circuit's lead, and many do not consider non-elective abortion to be a serious medical need.⁵⁸

The Eighth Circuit rejected the Missouri Department of Corrections' claim that its ban on transporting prisoners for abortions was reasonable. The Department argued that the ban applied equally to all elective procedures, making it just a "specific application of a general policy." The court disagreed, finding that "abortion [was] treated differently" from other medical care at the prison, and that this different treatment was not reasonable.⁵⁹

By contrast, the Fifth Circuit upheld a restriction that required a court order before abortions. The court accepted the jail's insistence that the court-order requirement did not target abortion, because it applied equally to transportation for other non-emergency medical care.⁶⁰ This case applies throughout Mississippi,

49. *Turner v. Safley*, 482 U.S. 78, 87, 107 S. Ct. 2254, 2261, 96 L. Ed. 2d 64, 78 (1987).

50. Diana Kasdan, *Abortion Access for Incarcerated Women: Are Correctional Health Practices in Conflict with Constitutional Standards?*, 41 *Perspectives on Sexual and Reproductive Health* 1, 59 (Mar. 2009), available at <http://www.guttmacher.org/pubs/psrh/full/4105909.pdf> (last visited Jan. 25, 2010).

51. *Monmouth County Corr. Institutional Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326, 341 (3d Cir. 1987) (citing *Turner v. Safley*, 107 S. Ct. 2254, 2262 (1987)).

52. *Monmouth County Corr. Institutional Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326, 341 (3d Cir. 1987) (citing *Turner v. Safley*, 107 S. Ct. 2254, 2262 (1987)).

53. *Monmouth County Corr. Institutional Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326, 351 (3d Cir. 1987); see also *Rust v. Sullivan*, 500 U.S. 173, 178, 203, 111 S. Ct. 1759, 114 L. Ed. 2d 233 (1991) (upholding federal regulation prohibiting federally funded medical clinics from counseling or referring women for abortion); *Webster v. Reproductive Health Serv.*, 492 U.S. 490, 511, 109 S. Ct. 3040, 106 L. Ed. 2d 410 (1989) (upholding Missouri statute prohibiting the use of public facilities or personnel from performing non-therapeutic abortions); *Harris v. McRae*, 448 U.S. 297, 302, 100 S. Ct. 2671, 65 L. Ed. 2d 784 (1980) (upholding congressional restriction of Medicaid funds for any abortion unnecessary to protect the life of the mother, or in cases involving rape or incest"); but see *Roe v. Crawford*, 514 F.3d 789, 801 (8th Cir. 2008) (finding that the *Monmouth* decision was "exceptionally broad" in requiring prisons to pay for elective abortions, and that "the Supreme Court has made it clear the state has no affirmative duty to provide, fund, or help procure an abortion for any member of the general population.").

54. N.Y. Penal Law § 125.05 (McKinney 2010).

55. *Bryant v. Maffucci*, 923 F.2d 979 (2d Cir. 1991).

56. *Bryant v. Maffucci*, 923 F.2d 979, 985 (2d Cir. 1991).

57. *Monmouth County Corr. Institutional Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326, 349 (3d Cir. 1987).

58. See, e.g., *Roe v. Crawford*, 514 F.3d 789 (8th Cir. 2008).

59. *Roe v. Crawford*, 514 F.3d 789, 797 (8th Cir. 2008).

60. *Victoria W. v. Larpenter*, 369 F.3d 475 (5th Cir. 2004).

Louisiana, and Texas; if you live in any of these states, you might have to get a court order before an abortion, and it may be difficult to challenge the prison's policy in court.

(b) Medically Necessary Abortions: Your Right under the Eight Amendment

At a minimum, courts agree that abortion is a serious medical need if it is necessary to preserve the female prisoner's health. For example, in *Roe v. Crawford*, the Eighth Circuit said that a "medically necessary abortion certainly could qualify as a serious medical need."⁶¹ The decision does not define "medically necessary" in the prison abortion context. But under long-standing Supreme Court precedent, medically necessary abortions include those that, in a physician's professional medical judgment, are necessary to prevent harm to the woman's physical or mental health.⁶² Because prisons have to provide for prisoners' serious medical needs, the prison authorities must pay for your medically necessary abortion if you cannot afford to pay for it yourself.⁶³ If you believe that you will suffer serious physical or mental health problems if you do not have an abortion and your doctor has confirmed this with you, you could have an Eighth Amendment claim if your prison denies you the right to an abortion.

(c) Access to Abortions

Your right to access an abortion varies depending on the kind of prison you are in and where it is located. In federal prison, federal regulations require female prisoners to be offered medical, religious, and social counseling before having an abortion.⁶⁴ The prisoner must be allowed to make the final decision herself.⁶⁵ Federal prisons do not have to pay for non-medically necessary abortions.⁶⁶ However, if a prisoner requests an abortion, and is entitled to one under state law, then a prison official is required to transport her to a clinic.⁶⁷

In state prisons, the rights of female prisoners to get abortions will depend on the state-specific abortion laws, which vary greatly. In the state of New York, an abortion is only allowed if:

- (1) The woman consents to have the abortion; and
- (2) A licensed physician performs the abortion.

The physician can only perform the abortion if:

- (1) The abortion is necessary to save the woman's life; or
- (2) It has been less than twenty-four weeks since the beginning of the pregnancy.⁶⁸

Some states, like California, have codes which say that women prisoners have the same right to an abortion as any other woman in the state.⁶⁹ Others are silent on the issue, and statistics show that a woman's experience in attempting to obtain one varies widely by state, and even by prison. In a recent survey of correctional health officials, 68% indicated that women in their prisons were allowed to have an elective abortion, but only 54% helped arrange appointments.⁷⁰

61. *Roe v. Crawford*, 514 F.3d 789, 799 (8th Cir. 2008) (finding that an elective abortion sought for non-medical reasons does not rise to the level of a "serious medical need" under the Eighth Amendment).

62. *Doe v. Bolton*, 410 U.S. 179, 192, 93 S. Ct. 739, 747, 35 L. Ed. 2d 201, 212–13 (1973).

63. *Harris v. McRae*, 448 U.S. 297, 100 S. Ct. 2671, 65 L. Ed. 2d 784 (1980).

64. 28 C.F.R. § 551.23(a)–(c) (McKinney 2010).

65. 28 C.F.R. § 551.23(a) (McKinney 2010).

66. *Harris v. McRae*, 448 U.S. 297, 326–27, 100 S. Ct. 2671, 2693, 65 L. Ed. 2d 784, 811 (1980).

67. *See Harris v. McRae*, 448 U.S. 297, 326, 100 S. Ct. 2671, 2693, 65 L. Ed. 2d 784, 811 (1980); *Monmouth County Corr. Institutional Inmates v. Lanzaro*, 834 F.2d 326, 351–52 (3d Cir. 1987).

68. N.Y. Penal Law § 125.05 (McKinney's 2010).

69. Cal. Penal Code § 4028 (West 2010).

70. The American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists, *Reproductive Health Care for Incarcerated Women and Adolescent Females* (Aug. 2012), available at <http://www.acog.org/~media/Committee%20Opinions/Committee%20on%20Health%20Care%20for%20Underserved%20Women/co535.pdf?dmc=1&ts=20120729T1321289430> (last visited Aug. 21, 2012).

4. Pregnancy

Many women report being pregnant at the time of their incarceration, including 4% of women in state prisons, 3% of women in federal prisons, and about 5% of women in jails nationwide.⁷¹ If you are pregnant, it is important to consult a medical professional and find a book in your prison library that will give you basic instructions on how to care for yourself during your pregnancy. A woman prisoner's treatment during pregnancy is important, and many prisons have procedures for risk assessment of pregnant prisoners, diet and nutrition, prenatal care, and work assignments. A good resource is the book *What to Expect When You're Expecting* by Arlene Eisenberg, Heidi E. Murkoff, and Sandy Hathaway. You should also consult a medical professional at your institution with any questions about your pregnancy.

In New York State, a pregnant prisoner has the right to complete and thorough prenatal care, which includes medical examinations, HIV education, and advice about exercise, safety, and nutrition.⁷² Shortly before she is about to give birth, a pregnant prisoner should be moved from the prison to a hospital, institution, or clinic and provided with comfortable accommodations, maintenance, and medical care.⁷³ She will be returned to the prison or jail as soon after the birth of her child as the state of her health permits.⁷⁴ The child that is born may be returned with its mother to the correctional institution in which the mother is confined unless the chief medical officer of the correctional institution certifies that the mother is physically unfit to care for the child, in which case the statement of the medical officer will be final. A child may remain in the correctional institution with its mother for such period as seems desirable for the welfare of such child, but not after it is one year of age, provided, however, if the mother is in a state reformatory and is to be paroled shortly after the child becomes one year of age. The child may remain at the state reformatory until its mother is paroled, but in no case after the child is eighteen months old.⁷⁵ In California, a pregnant prisoner has a right to receive necessary medical services from the physician of her choice, but if she chooses to go to a physician or receive a service not provided by the facility, then she has to pay the costs.⁷⁶

Federal prisons and some state prisons ban the use of shackles or leg irons on pregnant women while being transported to the hospital or during labor. In fact, some courts have recognized this practice as a violation of the Eighth Amendment.⁷⁷ Currently, sixteen states including New York, California, Connecticut, Illinois, Washington, and the District of Columbia have laws or policies that explicitly prevent this practice.⁷⁸ In these states, it is against the law to use shackles on women while they are in labor, and if this happens to you, you can sue the prison in state or federal court. However, in other states, it is still common to shackle women while on the way to the hospital, or even while they are in labor.⁷⁹ If you live in a state that does not currently have anti-shackling laws, you may still try to challenge this practice in federal court as a violation of the Eighth Amendment.

You may also have an Eighth Amendment claim if the prison is deliberately indifferent to your serious medical needs during your pregnancy, in other words, if they show a real lack of care towards you. In a case in Wisconsin, a female prisoner charged prison nurses with violating her Eighth Amendment rights by

71. Women in Prison Project, Correctional Association of New York, *Women in Prison Fact Sheet* (Apr. 2009), available at http://www.correctionalassociation.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Wome_in_Prison_Fact_Sheet_2009_FINAL.pdf (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

72. N.Y. Comp. Code R. & Regs. tit. 9, § 7651.17(a) (2010).

73. N.Y. Correct. Law § 611(1) (McKinney 2010).

74. N.Y. Correct. Law § 611(1) (McKinney 2010).

75. N.Y. Correct. Law § 611(2) (McKinney 2010).

76. Cal. Penal Code § 4023.6 (West 2010).

77. *Nelson v. Corr. Med. Services*, 583 F.3d 522 (8th Cir. 2009) (*en banc*) (holding it is clearly established that a woman “in the final stages of labor cannot be shackled absent clear evidence that she is a security or flight risk”); *Women Prisoners v. Dist. of Columbia*, 877 F. Supp. 634, 668–69 (D.D.C. 1994), *vacated and modified in part on other grounds*, 899 F.Supp. 659 (D.D.C. 1995).

78. Adam Liptak, *Prisons Often Shackle Inmates in Labor*, N.Y. Times, Mar. 2, 2006, available at <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/03/02/national/02shackles.html?pagewanted=2&r=1> (last visited Aug. 12, 2012); Sadhbh Walshe, *Women are Born Free in the US but Everywhere Give Birth in Chains*, The Guardian, Jun. 6, 2012, available at <http://www.guardian.co.uk/commentisfree/2012/jun/06/women-born-free-give-birth-in-chains> (last visited Aug 12 2012).

79. Adam Liptak, *Prisons Often Shackle Inmates in Labor*, N.Y. Times, Mar. 2, 2006, available at <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/03/02/national/02shackles.html?pagewanted=2&r=1> (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

failing to bring her to the hospital when she was in labor. The prisoner gave birth in her prison cell.⁸⁰ The court held that a reasonable jury could conclude that the nurses showed deliberate indifference toward the pregnant prisoner because the nurses ignored the prisoner's request to go to the hospital and they "only examined [her] through the small tray slot in the cell door, rather than conducting a more comprehensive exam."⁸¹

Pregnant prisoners have also had some success using state tort law to claim that prisons were negligent (or careless) in treating their medical needs during pregnancy and delivery. (As discussed above, negligence is easier to prove than deliberate indifference, so tort law can be a better option than the Eighth Amendment in the context of medical treatment.) For example, in a Louisiana case, the court found a prison responsible for the wrongful death of a premature baby born to a prisoner because the prison was careless in their treatment of the female prisoner. Prison officials did not follow the prison's procedures, failed to identify the problem despite complaints of bleeding and abdominal pain, and did not bring the prisoner to a hospital until it was too late to prevent the premature birth.⁸²

Prisons have a duty to care for you during your pregnancy and to provide you with safe conditions for labor. If these rights are violated, you may have a claim against the prison under the Eighth Amendment (requiring deliberate indifference) or state tort law (requiring negligence). For information on possible federal claims, see *JLM*, Chapter 14, "Prison Litigation Reform Act," and Chapter 16, "Using 42 U.S.C. 1983 and 28 U.S.C. 1331 to Obtain Relief from Violations of Federal Laws." For information on state tort claims, see *JLM*, Chapter 17, "The State's Duty to Protect You and Your Property: Tort Actions."

5. HIV & AIDS

Chapter 26 of the *JLM*, "Infectious Diseases (AIDS, Hepatitis, and Tuberculosis) in Prison," gives background information on AIDS and HIV, discusses the legal rights of HIV-positive prisoners, and provides a list of organizations offering education, support, and services to prisoners with AIDS.

Approximately 12% of women in New York's prisons are HIV-positive, twice the rate of infection for male prisoners, and 80 times higher than the rate in the general public.⁸³ Symptoms of HIV are often different for women than they are for men. Early signs for a woman suffering from HIV tend to be gynecological disorders, in particular pelvic inflammatory disease (PID), infections causing abnormal pap smears (cervical dysplasia), and chronic yeast infections.⁸⁴ Because these symptoms are typically not associated with HIV, many women go undiagnosed until the virus develops to become full-blown AIDS.⁸⁵ Women who are HIV-positive also have a higher risk of developing cervical cancer.⁸⁶ If you are HIV-positive, it is important to get a complete gynecological exam, including an inspection of the cervix (colposcopy) and a Pap smear every six months, in order to detect any problems early.⁸⁷

If you believe you may be infected with HIV or AIDS, you may have a right to be tested. Your right to testing may differ depending upon whether you are incarcerated in state or federal prison. See Chapter 26 of the *JLM* for more information on your right to HIV/AIDS testing.

D. Sexual Assault, Harassment, and Privacy Concerns

Chapter 24, "Your Right to be Free from Assault by Prison Guards and Other Prisoners," and Chapter 25, "Your Right to Be Free From Illegal Body Searches," address assault and illegal searches in general. This

80. Doe v. Gustavus, 294 F. Supp. 2d 1003, 1007 (E.D. Wisc. 2003).

81. Doe v. Gustavus, 294 F. Supp. 2d 1003, 1009 (E.D. Wisc. 2003).

82. Calloway v. City of New Orleans, 524 So. 2d 182, 187 (La. Ct. App. 1988).

83. Women in Prison Project, Correctional Association of New York, *Women in Prison Fact Sheet* (Apr. 2009), available at http://www.correctionalassociation.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/05/Wome_in_Prison_Fact_Sheet_2009_FINAL.pdf (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

84. Tracee Cornforth, About.com, *What are the Symptoms of HIV/AIDS in Women?* (July 2009), available at <http://womenshealth.about.com/od/aidshiv/f/HIVsymptoms.htm> (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

85. See Louise G. Trubek & Elizabeth A. Hoffmann, *Searching for a Balance in Universal Health Care Reform: Protection for the Disenfranchised Consumer*, 43 DePaul L. Rev. 1081, 1087 (1994).

86. American Cancer Society, *What are the Risk Factors for Cervical Cancer?* (Jan. 2010), available at <http://www.cancer.org/Cancer/CervicalCancer/DetailedGuide/cervical-cancer-risk-factors> (last visited Aug. 25, 2012).

87. National Cancer Institute, *What you Need to Know about Cervical Cancer* (Mar. 2012), available at <http://www.cancer.gov/cancerinfo/wyntk/cervix> (last visited Aug. 12, 2012).

Part focuses on three issues—privacy, sexual harassment, and sexual assault and rape—as they affect female prisoners specifically.

1. Privacy

This Section explains your right to be free from inappropriate pat-downs, involuntary exposure, and illegal body searches.

(a) Cross-gender Pat-downs

Under the Fourth Amendment of the Constitution, you are guaranteed the right to be free from unreasonable searches and seizures of your property.⁸⁸ However, the Supreme Court has found that this right is severely limited in prison because of the security concerns of prison and incarceration.⁸⁹ Nonetheless, a few courts have recognized that routine searches of women prisoners by male guards may violate the Eighth Amendment. For example, in *Jordan v. Gardner*, female prisoners protested the prison policy of random full-body pat-down searches by male guards. Many of these female prisoners had been severely sexually and physically abused by men in the past, and experienced severe trauma during these searches. As a result, the Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit found that these searches were “cruel and unusual” punishment in violation of the Eighth Amendment.⁹⁰ In New York, the Department of Corrections and Community Supervision (DOCCS) policy requires that, “whenever possible,” female guards—not male guards—should pat down female prisoners.⁹¹ However, following the lead of the Supreme Court, all courts recognize limitations on female prisoners’ right to privacy when it involves an emergency or another important prison security issue.⁹² For more information, please read *JLM*, Chapter 25, “Your Right to Be Free from Illegal Body Searches,” Part B.

(b) Involuntary Exposure

“Involuntary exposure” is when your naked (or partly naked) body is seen by guards of the opposite sex, such as when you are using showers or toilets. The Supreme Court in *Turner v. Safley* stated that prison regulations that restrict the rights of prisoners must be substantially related to some legitimate (justified) concern of the prison.⁹³ Thus, your privacy rights can be limited if the prison gives a reason that is substantially related to a legitimate prison policy.

One important prison policy is to treat male and female prison officials the same, as required by federal employment discrimination laws.⁹⁴ This can make it difficult to challenge involuntary exposure situations because prisons cannot treat male and female employees differently. Prisons cannot be required to assign only female workers to a position unless there is a legally recognized need for the position to be filled by a woman.⁹⁵ Courts have occasionally upheld the designation of certain jobs as female-only jobs, usually where

88. U.S. Const. amend IV.

89. See *Hudson v. Palmer*, 468 U.S. 517, 524, 104 S. Ct. 3194, 3198, 82 L. Ed. 2d 393, 400 (1984).

90. *Jordan v. Gardner*, 986 F.2d 1521, 1525–26 (9th Cir. 1993).

91. State of New York, Department of Corrections and Community Supervision Directive 4910, Control of and Search for Contraband, at 2–3 (as revised Dec. 11, 2006). Pat frisks are required when prisoners are entering the visiting room, when an entire area of the institution is being searched, when an officer has an articulable basis to suspect a prisoner possesses contraband, or as directed by supervisory staff. Pat frisks are also allowed when a prisoner is going or returning to housing, program, and recreation areas and outside work details.

92. See, e.g., *Carlin v. Manu*, 72 F. Supp. 2d 1177, 1179–80 (D. Or. 1999) (holding that observation by male guards during strip searches of female prisoners made by female guards was acceptable during an emergency removal to a male prison since the male guards were not touching the female prisoners, and it was a one-time event, as opposed to an indefinite infliction of pain).

93. *Turner v. Safley*, 482 U.S. 78, 87, 107 S. Ct. 2254, 2261, 96 L. Ed. 2d 64, 78 (1987).

94. Title VII of the U.S. Code prohibits denying employment, promotions, or raises based on sex, and the hiring of only female employees for female correctional facilities has been seen as a violation of this law. 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2(a)-(d) (2006). See, e.g., *Forts v. Ward*, 621 F.2d 1210, 1216 (2d Cir. 1980) (the court held that male prison guards could not be excluded from night shifts in a women’s prison because other measures to ensure prisoner privacy were available).

95. 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2(a)-(d) (2006). See, e.g., *Forts v. Ward*, 621 F.2d 1210, 1216 (2d Cir. 1980) (the court held that male prison guards could not be excluded from night shifts in a women’s prison because other measures to ensure prisoner privacy were available).

there is a strong privacy concern⁹⁶ or where there has been a long, well-recorded history of abuse by male officers and other efforts to address the problem have failed.⁹⁷ Some courts have recognized that all prisoners have a right to be free from unnecessary viewing in the nude or while performing private bodily functions by guards of the opposite sex, and a few courts have been particularly sensitive to the privacy interests of women prisoners, requiring that they be able to cover their windows when undressing or using the toilet.⁹⁸ But if these factors are not present, courts may decide that the prisoner's interest in protecting bodily privacy is not as strong as the state's interest in offering equal employment opportunities for correctional officers.⁹⁹ For more information on your right to be free from involuntary exposure, see *JLM*, Chapter 25, "Your Right to Be Free From Illegal Body Searches."

(c) Body Searches

In deciding whether a prison search violates your right to be free from unreasonable searches, courts weigh the need for prison security against the privacy interests of the prisoners. Then they decide which of these interests is more important in the particular case.¹⁰⁰ For example, one court held that when a prisoner is being moved from one area of a prison to another, the prison's need for a visual body cavity search to make sure the prisoner is not carrying drugs or weapons is more important than the prisoner's need for privacy.¹⁰¹ A "visual body cavity search" is when a prison officer inspects a prisoner's ears, nose, mouth, anus, or vagina to see if there are drugs, weapons, or other contraband.

Courts usually find that the prison's security concerns outweigh the prisoner's privacy interests. In some cases, courts have found that non-medical personnel (prison officers) are allowed to conduct clothed body frisks (searches of a prisoner's outer clothing),¹⁰² cell searches (searches of the prisoners' living area),¹⁰³ and

96. See *Mills v. City of Barboursville*, 389 F.3d 568, 579 (6th Cir. 2004) ("As to jail employees of the opposite gender viewing prison inmates or detainees, we have recognized that a prison policy forcing prisoners to be searched by members of the opposite sex or to be exposed to regular surveillance by officers of the opposite sex while naked—for example while in the shower or using a toilet in a cell—would provide the basis of a claim on which relief could be granted."); *Fortner v. Thomas*, 983 F.2d 1024, 1030 (11th Cir. 1993) (recognizing prisoners' right to bodily privacy "because most people have 'a special sense of privacy in their genitals, and involuntary exposure of them in the presence of people of the other sex may be especially demeaning and humiliating.'" (quoting *Lee v. Downs*, 641 F.2d 1117, 1119 (4th Cir. 1981))).

97. *Robino v. Iranon*, 145 F.3d 1109 (9th Cir. 1998) (male prison guards were excluded in order to accommodate the privacy of female prisoners and reduce risk of sexual conduct between guards and prisoners); *Jennings v. New York State Office of Mental Health*, 786 F. Supp. 376 (S.D.N.Y. 1992) (the court held that gender was a genuine requirement to be a "treatment assistant" in a female ward, and therefore, the requirement that at least one woman be assigned to a female prison ward was permissible under the Civil Rights Act); *Everson v. Mich. Dept. of Corr.*, 391 F.3d 737 (6th Cir. 2004) (the Court of Appeals for the Sixth Circuit found that officers in female prison housing units must be women because the prison adequately demonstrated that this policy would enhance security, decrease the likelihood of sexual abuse, protect the female prisoners' privacy rights, and there were no reasonable alternatives to this plan).

98. See, e.g., *Sepulveda v. Ramirez*, 967 F.2d 1413, 1415 (9th Cir. 1992) (denying qualified immunity to a male parole officer who walked in on a female parolee urinating as part of a required drug test); *Torres v. Wisconsin Dept. of Health & Soc. Servs.*, 838 F.2d 944, 946–47 (7th Cir. 1988), *rev'd in part*, 859 F.2d 1523 (7th Cir. 1988) (suggesting that to protect female prisoners' privacy, prisons could provide them with appropriate sleepwear and allow them to cover their windows while dressing or using the toilet); *Forts v. Ward*, 621 F.2d 1210, 1214–16 (2d Cir. 1980) (allowing female prisoners to cover the window of their cells for privacy for 15 minute intervals).

99. See *Grummett v. Rushen*, 779 F.2d 491, 495 (9th Cir. 1985) (finding that to restrict or disallow female guards from holding positions which involve occasional viewing of male prisoners would require tremendous rearrangement of work schedules and possibly produce a risk to both internal security needs and equal employment opportunities for female guards).

100. See *Hudson v. Palmer*, 468 U.S. 517, 527, 104 S. Ct. 3194, 3200, L. Ed. 2d 393, 403 (1984) ("[It would be] impossible to accomplish the prison objectives [of ensuring the safety of prisoners, staff and visitors] if inmates retained a right of privacy in their cells."); *Bell v. Wolfish*, 441 U.S. 520, 557, 99 S. Ct. 1861, 1883, 60 L. Ed. 2d 447, 480 (1979) ("[R]oom searches represent an appropriate security measure.").

101. *Goff v. Nix*, 803 F.2d 358, 366–71 (8th Cir. 1986).

102. See *Smith v. Fairman*, 678 F.2d 52, 54 (7th Cir. 1982) (holding female guards may conduct "pat down" searches without violating male prisoners' privacy).

103. See *Hudson v. Palmer*, 468 U.S. 517, 525–26, 104 S. Ct. 3194, 3199, 82 L. Ed. 2d 393, 402–03 (1984) (holding that a prisoner has no reasonable expectation of privacy in her cell); *Martin v. Lane*, 766 F. Supp. 641, 646 (N.D. Ill. 1991) (applying *Hudson v. Palmer* to deny Fourth Amendment relief to prisoner whose cell was searched during

visual body cavity or strip searches (searches where prisoners take off their clothes and are visually inspected by a guard).¹⁰⁴ Particularly appalling circumstances may persuade a court that the search was unconstitutional. For example, in one federal case, the court found that it was a violation of due process to force a female pretrial detainee who was seven months pregnant to squat uncomfortably for two visual body cavity searches by untrained officers.¹⁰⁵

However, the test for a “digital body cavity search”—when a guard places his or her fingers into a prisoner’s nose, mouth, anus, or vagina—is stricter because it is more intrusive of your body than other types of searches. To perform a digital body cavity search, prison officials must have a reasonable suspicion that is *specific* to the individual prisoner, such as a suspicion that a prisoner has a weapon.¹⁰⁶ Courts have found that digital body cavity searches are unreasonable unless medical personnel perform them both in a private area and in a hygienic (clean) manner.¹⁰⁷ The presence of male officers is also a circumstance that might make a digital body search unreasonable for women prisoners.¹⁰⁸ Similarly, medical personnel (physicians, nurses, or their assistants), *not* correctional personnel, must conduct body cavity searches that involve putting an instrument into a part of a prisoner’s body or taking something out of a body cavity.¹⁰⁹

In conclusion, women prisoners may be searched because of security concerns in prison, but these searches must be conducted for a good reason and in a safe and respectful manner. For more information on illegal searches and potential legal remedies, see *JLM*, Chapter 25, “Your Right to Be Free from Illegal Body Searches.”

2. Sexual Harassment

Just because you are in prison does not mean you give up your right to be free from unwanted sexual activity. Any unwanted sexual attention that you experience, like leering, pinching, patting, verbal comments, or pressure to engage in sexual activity can be considered sexual assault or harassment.

Female prisoners should never feel forced to engage in sexual activity with abusive staff who promise better treatment or threaten disciplinary action.¹¹⁰ You have the right to be free from any unwanted sexual attention. If an officer acts inappropriately towards you in a sexual manner, it may be considered cruel and unusual punishment in violation of your Eighth Amendment rights.

To qualify as a violation of the Eighth Amendment, the behavior must be sufficiently serious, and the officer must have had a culpable (deliberate) state of mind.¹¹¹ Specifically, you must establish that the officer acted in “wanton” (unjustifiable) disregard of your rights, or with a “malicious or sadistic purpose.” Since there is no legitimate purpose for sexual abuse, the behavior itself is generally enough to show “wantonness.”¹¹² However, some kinds of sexual groping or touching have been found not to violate the

a lockdown).

104. See *Bell v. Wolfish*, 441 U.S. 520, 558, 99 S. Ct. 1861, 1884, 60 L. Ed. 2d 447, 481 (1979) (holding that visual body cavity searches of prisoners in a pre-trial detention facility did not violate the Fourth Amendment, as it did not punish the prisoner prior to trial, and served the legitimate purpose of insuring prison security). The gender of the guards assigned to conduct the searches is not mentioned in the case.

105. *United States ex rel. Guy v. McCauley*, 385 F. Supp. 193, 198 (E.D. Wis. 1974) (finding seven-months pregnant prisoner was twice forced to bend over painfully by officers who were not medically trained, and that they did not conduct the search in a medical environment or use appropriate medical equipment).

106. See *Chapman v. Nichols*, 989 F.2d 393, 395 (10th Cir. 1993) (holding that blanket policy for strip searches of detainees was unconstitutional).

107. See *Bonitz v. Fair*, 804 F.2d 164, 172–73 (1st Cir. 1986) *overruled in part* by *Unwin v. Campbell*, 863 F.2d 124 (1st Cir. 1988) (finding Fourth Amendment violation where digital body searches were performed by non-medical personnel in a non-hygienic manner in the presence of male personnel).

108. See *Bonitz v. Fair*, 804 F.2d 164, 172–73 (1st Cir. 1986) (pointing to the presence of male officers as one reason why the search of these prisoners was unreasonable).

109. See *DaVee v. Mathis*, 812 S.W.2d 816, 824–26 (Mo. Ct. App. 1991) (concluding that while searches involving physical intrusion and removal of foreign objects must be conducted by medical personnel, the search in question did not involve physical contact and was thus conducted in a reasonable manner).

110. Human Rights Watch, *All Too Familiar: Sexual Abuse of Women in U.S. State Prisons* (1996), available at http://www.hrw.org/legacy/reports/1996/Us1.htm#N_880 (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

111. *Farmer v. Brennan*, 511 U.S. 825, 834, 114 S. Ct. 1970, 1977, 128 L. Ed. 2d 811 (1994); *Wilson v. Seiter*, 501 U.S. 294, 298–99 (1991).

112. *Boddie v. Schneider*, 105 F.3d 857, 861 (2d Cir. 1997); *Giron v. Corr. Corp. of America*, 191 F.3d 1281, 1290

Eighth Amendment, as they are not sufficiently serious, or the officers did not needlessly violate the prisoner's rights.¹¹³

If you cannot bring an Eighth Amendment claim against the prison official who harassed you, you may be able to bring an Eighth Amendment claim against supervisory officials for failing to protect you from unwanted sexual conduct. To do this, you have to show that supervisors were "deliberately indifferent" towards your abuse (meaning that they knew about the harassment and did nothing),¹¹⁴ and that the act violated "evolving standards of decency" (in other words, the act violated the level of physical contact that is acceptable in such situations today).¹¹⁵ Some courts have found that certain extreme cases of sexual groping and touching do violate "evolving standards of decency." If your case is similar, you might be able to make an Eighth Amendment claim against the supervisors.¹¹⁶

To bring an Eighth Amendment claim in federal court, you must have exhausted your administrative remedies. Most prisons do NOT have confidential procedures, and sometimes, even if a prison procedure is described as confidential, prisoners and staff may still be able to find out about your claim. For example, in New York, grievances alleging sexual abuse by an officer go through a special procedure that skips the Inmate Grievance Coordinator, and goes directly to the Superintendent.¹¹⁷ As soon as the allegation is investigated by the Inspector General, it can become known to other prisoners and staff. Making an allegation of harassment is therefore a personal decision, and it is important to consider all the potential consequences before deciding to do so. For more information on how to make an Eighth Amendment claim, consult *JLM*, Chapter 16, "Using 42 U.S.C. 1983 and 28 U.S.C. 1331 to Obtain Relief from Violations of Federal Law."

3. Sexual Assault and Rape

(a) Your Right to be Free from Sexual Assault and Rape

The rate of female sexual assault varies dramatically between prisons, with the highest rate currently standing at one in four women being assaulted during their time in prison.¹¹⁸ While a prison official is permitted to touch you for security reasons, for example in a legal search, he or she is never allowed to touch you in a sexual way. Under federal law, it is illegal for a prison official with "custodial, supervisory, or disciplinary authority" to engage in any type of sexual conduct with prisoners.¹¹⁹ In federal prisons, it is also a felony for prison officers to obtain sex from a prisoner by using violence or the threat of violence, or to have sex with a prisoner after making her unconscious with drugs or alcohol.¹²⁰ Most states also have laws that make sex between prisoners and prison officers illegal. Check your state's laws to see what kind of protections you are offered.

(10th Cir. 1999).

113. *Boddie v. Schneider*, 105 F.3d 857, 861 (2d Cir. 1997) (requiring severe or repeated sexual abuse for Eighth Amendment violation); *Morrison v. Cortright*, 397 F. Supp. 2d 424, 425 (W.D.N.Y. 2005) (male correctional officer running finger between buttocks and pressing against male plaintiff during strip frisk); *Davis v. Castleberry*, 364 F. Supp.2d 319, 321 (W.D.N.Y. 2005) (male correctional officer grabbing a male prisoner's penis during a pat frisk); *Montero v. Crusie*, 153 F. Supp.2d 368, 373, 375 (S.D.N.Y. 2001) (allegations that a male officer squeezed the male plaintiff's genitalia and made sexual propositions during pat frisks and offered privileges in exchange for sexual favors).

114. *Farmer v. Brennan*, 511 U.S. 825, 834, 114 S. Ct. 1970, 1977, 128 L. Ed. 2d 811, 824 (1994).

115. *Trop v. Dulles*, 356 U.S. 86, 101, 78 S. Ct. 590, 598, 2 L. Ed. 2d 630, 642 (1958).

116. See *Rodriguez v. McClenning*, 399 F. Supp. 2d 228, 237–38 (S.D.N.Y. 2005) (allowing a male prisoner's claim that he was groped by a correctional officer to proceed to court, relying on trend toward statutory prohibition of sexual contact between prison employees and prisoners); *Schwenk v. Hartford*, 204 F.3d 1187, 1197 (9th Cir. 2000) ("Rape, coerced sodomy, unsolicited touching of women prisoners' vaginas, breasts and buttocks by prison employees are 'simply not part of the penalty that criminal offenders pay for their offenses against society.'").

117. N.Y. Comp. Codes R. & Regs. tit. 7, § 701.8 (2010).

118. Just Detention International, *The Basics about Sexual Abuse in U.S. Detention* (Jan. 2009), available at <http://www.justdetention.org/en/factsheets/TheBasics.pdf> (last visited Nov. 28, 2012) (quoting Cindy Struckman-Johnson & David Struckman-Johnson, *Sexual Coercion Reported by Women in Three Midwestern Prisons*, 39 J. Sex Res. 217, 220 (2002)).

119. 18 U.S.C. § 2243 (2006).

120. 18 U.S.C. § 2241 (2006).

Even consensual sex between a prisoner and a prison official can be a violation of the Eighth Amendment or a crime under state law.¹²¹ In New York, sexual contact between an employee of the New York State Department of Correctional Services and a prisoner—even with the prisoner’s consent—is considered rape.¹²² The reason for this policy is that prison officials may attempt to abuse their position of authority to get sexual favors from prisoners.

Prison officials may also be liable for the acts of another prisoner under the Eighth Amendment. The officer will be liable if you are sexually assaulted by another prisoner when he or she knew that you faced a substantial risk of serious harm, but did nothing to protect you.¹²³ For example, if prison officials knew that you were going to be sexually assaulted by another inmate and did not try to prevent the assault, that could be a violation of your Eighth Amendment rights.

(b) What should you do if you have been raped or sexually assaulted?

If you have been raped or sexually assaulted, you should tell someone immediately and request to go to the hospital. Getting a medical exam (including a vaginal inspection and blood tests) at a hospital emergency room or other medical facility after you have been raped is important for several reasons:¹²⁴

- (1) Internal injuries can be assessed. Some injuries that you can’t see or feel can only be detected by examination.
- (2) Pregnancy can be prevented. If you are not using birth control, “morning-after” emergency contraceptives greatly decrease the chance of pregnancy.
- (3) Evidence can be collected. Physical evidence that can identify and convict your rapist can be captured and stored in what is called a “rape kit.”

A rape kit is evidence that can be used in court if you choose to bring charges. Many hospitals have “Sexual Assault Rape Trauma” nurses (called “SART nurses”) who specialize in collecting evidence from rape victims. You should ask at your hospital if there is a SART nurse available to collect your rape kit. Many hospitals also provide rape trauma counselors to help assist you during the examination process. To complete the rape kit, medical professionals will:

- (1) Collect any semen, other body fluids, and hair;
- (2) Look for clothing fibers and evidence from the scene, such as grass or soil; and
- (3) Take clippings of your fingernails to examine any residue from your attacker.

You should also ask the nurse or health professional to take pictures of any injuries that occurred during the attack (bruises, hand marks, cuts, burns, etc.). If you want to skip any particular part of the exam because it makes you feel too uncomfortable, you have the right to do so. Bear in mind though, nurses will try to collect as much evidence as possible in order to give you a stronger case.

It is important to make a rape kit so that you can prosecute your rapist later if you choose to do so. You do not have to decide immediately whether to report the rape to the prison authorities; you can collect the evidence now and then decide later. But if you choose to prosecute the person who raped you, your chances of convicting them depend heavily on the evidence in your rape kit. You only have one chance to get that evidence—immediately after the rape. Because of this, it is important that you do not bathe or shower, brush

121. See, e.g., *Carrigan v. Davis*, 70 F. Supp. 2d 448, 452–53 (D. Del. 1999) (“[A]s a matter of law, an act of vaginal intercourse and/or fellatio between a prison inmate and a prison guard, whether consensual or not, is a per se violation of the Eighth Amendment.”). Note that this holding was restricted to vaginal intercourse and/or fellatio. *Cash v. County of Erie*, Slip Op., 2009 WL 3199558, (W.D.N.Y. Sept. 30, 2009); *Hammond v. Gordon County*, 316 F. Supp. 2d 1262, 1285 n.6 (N.D. Ga. 2002); see also *Paz v. Weir*, 137 F. Supp. 2d 782, 807–09 (S.D. Tex. 2001) (noting that Texas law deems sex non-consensual if engaged in by a public servant who exerts coercion on the other person); but see *Freitas v. Ault*, 109 F.3d 1335, 1338–39 (8th Cir. 1997); *Fisher v. Goord*, 981 F. Supp. 140, 174–75 (W.D.N.Y. 1997) (though pre-Criminalization Statute).

122. N.Y. Penal Law § 130.05(3)(e), (f) (2011).

123. *Farmer v. Brennan*, 511 U.S. 825, 847, 114 S. Ct. 1970, 1084, 128 L. Ed. 2d 811, 831 (1994) (holding that a prison official was liable under the Eighth Amendment because he had knowledge that a transsexual prisoner faced a substantial risk of serious harm and subsequently disregarded the risk).

124. Nancy Larson, About.com, *After Rape, Getting A Medical Exam is Essential* (Dec. 5, 2011), available at <http://womenshealth.about.com/lw/Health-Medicine/Womens-Health/After-Rape-Getting-a-Medical-nbsp-Exam-is-Essential.htm> (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

your hair, change your clothes or shoes, or douche until after you have gone to the hospital and had samples collected.

It is important to see a doctor again within a week or two to receive your blood test results and to treat any injuries. Emotional care is also very important. Many rape survivors will experience Rape Trauma Syndrome (RTS), a collection of emotional responses to the extreme stress of the sexual assault. Some survivors openly display their emotions; others may appear calm and detached. Sleeping and eating patterns may change and nightmares are common. It is important for you to seek and continue counseling and support groups for as long as you need them. Your prison should provide counseling for rape and sexual assault. However, you should know that many mental health providers employed by corrections departments have an obligation to report any abuse that is disclosed to them. So, if you want to discuss your abuse without reporting it, you should ask your counselor about his reporting obligations before sharing information.

If your facility does not provide counseling, the Rape, Abuse and Incest National Network (RAINN) offers counseling and other forms of assistance to rape and sexual assault victims. You can reach their hotline at 1-800-656-HOPE (1-800-656-4673), online at <https://ohl.rainn.org/online/>, or write to them at:

Rape, Abuse & Incest National Network
1220 L Street NW, Suite 505
Washington, DC 20005

(c) What Are Your Legal Remedies if You Have Been Raped or Sexually Assaulted?

As an initial step, you should file a report through your prison's internal grievance procedures. If the prison administration does not remedy the situation, you may also want to consider bringing civil charges.

If you decide to bring a lawsuit in a civil court, the Prison Litigation Reform Act (PLRA) will apply to you. This Act states that prisoners cannot bring a civil lawsuit for any mental or emotional injury suffered in prison without showing some kind of physical injury.¹²⁵ This makes the collection of physical evidence through a rape kit even more important. However, many courts have interpreted sexual assault and rape to meet the "physical injury" requirements of the PLRA.¹²⁶ Similarly, the Second Circuit has held that sexual assaults alleged to arise from "intrusive body searches" meet the physical injury requirement.¹²⁷

Some courts have found that a prison official's sexual assault of a prisoner violates the Eighth Amendment, because it is "cruel and unusual punishment"¹²⁸ and violates the "evolving standards of decency that mark the progress of a maturing society,"¹²⁹ meaning that the conduct violates standards of conduct considered acceptable today. In *Women Prisoners v. District of Columbia*, the court stated that "rape, coerced sodomy, unsolicited touching of women prisoners' vaginas, breasts and buttocks by prison employees are 'simply not part of the penalty that criminal offenders pay for their offenses against society.'"¹³⁰

As described in the "Sexual Harassment" Section above, there are two components to bringing an Eighth Amendment claim against prison supervisors. First, you have to show that there was a substantial risk of serious harm to your safety.¹³¹ Second, you must show that the prison knew about the situation and yet did

125. Prison Litigation Reform Act of 1995, 104 Pub. L. 134, §§ 801–10, 110 Stat. 1321. See Chapter 14 of the *JLM*, "The Prison Litigation Reform Act," for more information on the PLRA.

126. *Williams v. Prudden*, 67 Fed. App'x 976, 977, 2003 WL 21135681, at *1 (8th Cir. 2003) (officer caused bodily harm when he grabbed plaintiff's breast, verbally demanded sexual favors, made physical sexual advances and attempted to force himself upon her); *Noguera v. Hasty*, 2001 WL 243535, at *5 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 12, 2001) (rape of prisoner met physical injury requirement); *Kemner v. Hemphill*, 199 F. Supp. 2d 1264 (N.D. Florida 2002) (forcible oral sodomy of prisoner met physical injury requirement); *Marrie v. Nickels*, 70 F. Supp. 2d 1252, 1264 (D. Kansas, 1999) (touching of buttocks and genitals during search constituted physical harm).

127. *Liner v. Goord*, 196 F.3d 132, 135 (2d Cir. 1999) (holding that allegations of sexual assault "qualify as physical injuries").

128. U.S. Const. amend. VIII.

129. *Estelle v. Gamble*, 429 U.S. 97, 103, 97 S. Ct. 285, 50 L. Ed. 2d 251 (1976).

130. *Women Prisoners of the Dist. of Columbia Dept. of Corr. v. Dist. of Columbia*, 877 F. Supp. 634, 665 (D.D.C. 1994) (quoting *Farmer v. Brennan*, 511 U.S. 825, 834, 114 S. Ct. 1970, 128 L. Ed. 2d 811, 823 (1994)), *aff'd in part and vacated in part*, 9 F.3d 910 (D.C. Cir. 1996).

131. *Farmer v. Brennan*, 511 U.S. 825, 831, 114 S. Ct. 1970, 1975, 128 L. Ed. 2d 811, 821 (1994).

nothing about it. For more information on how to bring an Eighth Amendment claim, see Chapter 16 of the *JLM*, “Using 42 U.S.C. 1983 and 28 U.S.C. 1331 to Obtain Relief from Violations of Federal Law.”

(d) Your Right to Go Forward with your Claim

It can be difficult to understand and work your way through a prison’s confusing grievance system. Women prisoners also have real concerns about retaliation by prison staff when filing complaints, especially those alleging sexual misconduct. Often, grievances are part of your inmate file that can be reviewed by guards. Understandably, you may fear that your complaint will not be confidential and that you will be harassed or transferred if you file a grievance.

While it may be difficult to come forward with a report of sexual assault or rape, you should know that courts have recognized that any type of sexual contact by a corrections officer is wrong, and you have a right to be free from such abuse, as well as free from retaliation for reporting it. Some states have taken steps to protect women prisoners from retaliation for reporting sexual misconduct by prison staff. For example, New York and California have made it illegal for prison guards to retaliate against prisoners who report them.¹³²

E. Drug Treatment Programs

The crackdown on drugs has been a major cause of the female prison population growth. As of January 2009, nearly 30% of women in New York’s prisons were incarcerated for a drug offense.¹³³ Furthermore, drug offenses accounted for 91% of the increase in the number of women sentenced to prison from 1986 to 1995. This trend is partially due to New York’s harsh Rockefeller Drug Laws, which gave judges little discretion in sentencing for drug offenses. However, in 2004, New York reformed the state’s old Rockefeller drug laws by adopting the Drug Law Reform Act (DLRA).¹³⁴ If you were sentenced under the old laws, you may be allowed to apply for re-sentencing. For more information, read *JLM*, Chapter 10, “Applying for Re-Sentencing for Drug Offenses.”

If you are in prison for a drug-related offense, you might have access to various alternative sentencing programs—even if you are already in prison. One of these options is the “drug court.”¹³⁵ In this type of program, judges, prosecutors, and defense attorneys take part in the treatment and rehabilitation of the offenders.¹³⁶ Judges keep track of the treatment and progress of offenders and the offenders follow a plan that includes detoxification (coming off drugs), counseling, education, vocational courses, group meetings, and urine testing.¹³⁷ According to the U.S. General Accounting Office, drug court programs are in place in 48 states, the District of Columbia, and Puerto Rico.¹³⁸

Another alternative sentence that might be right for you is a “boot camp,” or a military-style program that attempts to “instill discipline and self-respect in participants.”¹³⁹ However, due to budgetary constraints and doubts as to their ability to deter convicts from returning to crime, these programs are increasingly rare, as is their availability to women.¹⁴⁰ Even if you are in a regular correctional facility, your institution should have drug treatment programs available to you. For example, the Federal Bureau of Prisons (BOP) offers drug treatment plans to all inmates who qualify, prior to their release from custody.

132. Cal. Code Regs. tit. 15, § 3401.5(f) (West 2010); State of New York, Department of Correctional Services, Directive 4027A, Sexual Abuse Prevention and Intervention, at 3 (as revised Aug. 16, 2011).

133. Women in Prison Project, Correctional Association of New York, *Women in Prison Fact Sheet* (Apr. 2009), available at <http://www.correctionalassociation.org/resource/women-in-prison-fact-sheet> (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

134. 2004 N.Y. Sess. Laws 1474 (A. 11895, S. 7802).

135. See Kara Stinson, *Letting Time Serve You: Boot Camps and Alternative Sentencing for Female Offenders*, 39 Brandeis L. J. 847, 857 (2001).

136. See Kara Stinson, *Letting Time Serve You: Boot Camps and Alternative Sentencing for Female Offenders*, 39 Brandeis L. J. 847, 857 (2001).

137. See Kara Stinson, *Letting Time Serve You: Boot Camps and Alternative Sentencing for Female Offenders*, 39 Brandeis L. J. 847, 857 (2001).

138. U.S. General Accounting Office, “Drug Courts: Better DOJ Data Collection and Evaluation Efforts Needed To Measure Impact of Drug Court Programs,” (GAO-02-434: Government Printing Office, Apr. 2002).

139. See Kara Stinson, *Letting Time Serve You: Boot Camps and Alternative Sentencing for Female Offenders*, 39 Brandeis L.J. 847, 853 (2001).

140. See Richard Willing, *U.S. Prisons to End Boot Camp Programs*, (Feb. 2005), available at http://www.usatoday.com/news/nation/2005-02-03-boot-camps_x.htm (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

F. Clemency

“Clemency” is a term used to describe the power of a public official to lessen the sentence of a criminal defendant. Clemency exists to prevent a prisoner from receiving an unjustifiably harsh sentence for the crimes they have committed.

It is very hard to get clemency, but you should file a petition if think you have a good reason to receive it. In thirty-five states, including New York, the governor grants clemency. In other states an advisory board makes the decision, or the governor and advisory board make the decision together. Non-violent offenders have the best chance of getting clemency, but women who are in jail for killing their abusive spouses may also have a chance. Note that if you are currently seeking clemency for a death sentence, you have a right to a lawyer.¹⁴¹

There are four types of clemency: amnesty, reprieve, pardon, and commutation:

- (1) **Amnesty** applies to a group of people who have committed political offenses.
- (2) **Reprieve** postpones a scheduled execution.
- (3) **Pardon** attempts to clear a person’s name of a crime entirely and restore their reputation.
- (4) **Commutation** does not attempt to clear the person’s name of the crime, but merely substitutes a milder sentence for the current sentence being served.

This Part focuses on clemency for battered women, but the procedures discussed below apply to any clemency petition. For more information on clemency in the state of New York, see “Guidelines for Review of Executive Clemency Applications,” which is on file in the law library of each correctional facility in New York.¹⁴² For more information on pardons, commutations, and other forms of early release, please see *JLM*, Chapter 35, “Getting Out Early: Conditional and Early Release.” If you are not in New York, you must look up your state’s rules on clemency.¹⁴³ For further information on clemency for battered women nationwide, contact the National Clearinghouse for the Defense of Battered Women, which accepts collect calls from incarcerated battered women (see Appendix A).

1. How to Request Clemency

To be considered for clemency in New York, send a written petition requesting clemency to either of the following addresses:

The Governor of the State of New York
Executive Chamber
State Capitol
Albany, New York 12224

Director, Executive Clemency Bureau
N.Y. State Division of Parole
97 Central Avenue
Albany, New York 12206

You should send all supporting materials within thirty days of sending the application. Applications are usually considered in the order in which they are received. If your petition has not been granted, you can re-apply a year after you found out about the decision, unless you have been authorized to do so sooner in the letter informing you of the unfavorable decision.¹⁴⁴ In either case, you will be informed of the decision by letter from the Clemency Bureau of your state.

141. *Harbison v. Bell*, 129 S. Ct. 1481, 1483, 173 L. Ed. 2d 347, 352 (2009).

142. N.Y. State Div. of Parole, *New York State Parole Handbook: Questions and Answers Concerning Parole Release and Supervision 45* (2007), available at <https://www.parole.ny.gov/pdf/handbook6-09.pdf> (last visited Aug. 13, 2012).

143. To find your state’s requirements for commutation, go to the Criminal Justice Policy Foundation website, and click “Find your State” and then your state name (<http://www.cjpf.org/clemency/find-your-state>) (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

144. Criminal Justice Policy Foundation, *New York Applicable Form of Executive Clemency* (May 2004), available at <http://www.cjpf.org/clemency/NewYork.html> (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

2. Writing Your Petition

(a) Tips for Organizing Your Petition

Try to make the petition as brief as you can, but be sure not leave out any information you think is important. Use headings to separate the points that you make. If you have evidence of past incidents of abuse, it may be helpful to make a table that includes the date of each incident, the details of the abuse, and the evidence of the incident.

For example:¹⁴⁵

DATE	NATURE OF THE ABUSE	DOCUMENT
7/1/70	Dan found on top of Paula with his hands around her neck.	Smith Affidavit, Exhibit 1
11/23/72	Dan beats Paula so badly that she has contusions all over her body.	Cook County Hospital Records, Exhibit 2
10/3/75	Crisis Center overhears abuse and calls police.	Support Service Records, Exhibit 4
4/4/73	Dan violates restraining order. He is arrested for punching hand through window.	Police Report, Exhibit 6

You should describe the strongest part of your petition at the beginning of the document, in the first paragraph. You may wish to include any special circumstances that affect your case, or significant achievements you have accomplished in prison. For example, one woman who recently submitted a petition for clemency graduated summa cum laude from Western Michigan University while in prison.¹⁴⁶ Another woman's sentencing judge specifically stated that he hoped the Parole Board would commute her sentence.¹⁴⁷ Put such facts at the beginning. Do not hide facts like these in the middle of the petition.

(b) What to Include in Your Petition

Your clemency petition should include a thorough description of your life before you were convicted. This description should:

- (1) Let the Board know what kind of person you were;
- (2) Discuss your childhood, your family, your hobbies, and your ambitions;
- (3) Record your educational background, the names of any organizations to which you belonged, and every job you have held, including responsibilities and length of employment; and
- (4) Briefly discuss your criminal history and any type of domestic violence (sexual, physical, and/or emotional) you may have experienced throughout your life.

You should also describe the event causing your conviction, and note any differences between the evidence that was entered at your trial and what is known now. If you want to give a different version of what happened from what you said before trial or from the facts as found to be true at trial, you should explain these differences.

Next, you should describe why you think you should get clemency (your "theory of the case"). Your theory should set out the facts, law, and any policy reasons supporting your petition for clemency. If your criminal case went to trial, you may want to base your theory for clemency on the defense presented at trial.

Finally, describe why the Governor should grant you a special exception (the "plea for justice or mercy"). Clemency is extraordinary relief and you should remind the Governor that only he or she has the power to grant it.

145. Michigan Women's Justice and Clemency Project, Clemency Manual, Chapter VII (2008), available at http://www.umich.edu/~clemency/clemency_mnl/ch7.html (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

146. Michigan Women's Justice and Clemency Project, Clemency Manual, Chapter VII (2008), available at http://www.umich.edu/~clemency/clemency_mnl/ch7.html (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

147. Michigan Women's Justice and Clemency Project, Clemency Manual, Chapter VII (2008), available at http://www.umich.edu/~clemency/clemency_mnl/ch7.html (last visited Nov. 28, 2012).

You want to show the Governor that you are a model prisoner making the most of the rehabilitative services available to you in prison. If you have taken or completed any courses in prison, include copies of your transcripts, grades, diplomas, and degrees. You should also include any skills programs or counseling programs you have completed, and include any certificates from the programs. If you are in a privileged housing area or have been moved to a lower security level, explain this and list the privileges that you have received. If you have a clean disciplinary record, list any housing honors and explain how you were able to avoid disciplinary problems. Also include any jobs that you have held at the facility, your length of employment at each job, and your duties and responsibilities. If you know a prison official, including a counselor, who will support your clemency petition, ask them to write a letter on your behalf. Finally, list the people that you have stayed in contact with through visits, phone calls, and letters.

It is very important to show the Governor that you will be a productive and law-abiding member of society after your release. Write down your plans for the future, including where you will live, support groups and/or therapy in which you will participate, family and friends who will help support you financially and emotionally, plans to seek help for a drug or alcohol addiction, employment plans (including marketable skills that will help you find a job), and family plans.

You should also provide evidence to help give the Governor a sense of who you are as a person. Try to get letters from family members discussing their relationship with you, particularly if you have any children or grandchildren who are dependent on you. If a family member is able to offer you a place to live or a job upon release, include this information. Consider getting letters from religious or community leaders describing your involvement in their organization. Also consider letters from people who knew you as a child, especially if you suffered abuse, neglect, or other hardships growing up. Finally, you may be able to get members of the victim's family to write a letter stating that they are not opposed to your clemency petition. Keep in mind that this is a very sensitive issue and do not press for such a letter if you have reason to think that the victim's family may oppose your request.

(c) Using Evidence to Support Your Petition

You should include evidence to support all of the aspects of your claim,¹⁴⁸ and label them as "exhibits" at the back of your petition. When using affidavits or letters, state whether the authors of those affidavits or letters testified at your criminal trial. Because you may have difficulty getting all of these documents while in prison, try to have a close friend or family member assist you in gathering this information and developing your petition. Here are some basic types of evidence to consider:

- (1) Affidavits. Affidavits are where a person writes out facts that they know to be true in the form of a statement. The person signs the affidavit in front of a notary to make it authoritative. For example, if someone was with you during the events that led to your incarceration, you might want them to write an affidavit stating what happened.
- (2) Records, including hospital records, police records, and sentencing materials.
- (3) Letters, e-mail printouts, photographs, and anything that shows your story to be true.
- (4) Letters of support written by people who believe you should receive a commutation. You can ask for letters of support from family, clergy, prison staff, and possibly the victim's family. More information on letters of support is below.

To show that you were abused or battered, think about the following types of evidence:

- (1) Medical records of injuries from abuse;
- (2) Mental health records showing your diminished capacity at the time of the crime and/or the stress, fear and anxiety caused by living in a violent relationship;
- (3) Orders of protection;
- (4) Police reports related to the abuse;
- (5) Photographs showing physical injury;
- (6) Records from battered women's shelters;
- (7) Any testimony referring to battered women's syndrome at your trial. Include the abuser's criminal history if he had a violent criminal past.

148. Michigan Women's Justice and Clemency Project, Clemency Manual, Chapter VII (2008), available at http://www.umich.edu/~clemency/clemency_mnl/ch7.html (last visited Nov. 28, 2012)

To get police records, you should call or write to the county where the incident happened. Different police departments have different policies and you may have to fill out a Freedom of Information Law (“FOIL”) request. To learn more about how to make a FOIL request, see *JLM*, Chapter 7, “Freedom of Information.” To get hospital records, call or write to the patient records office at the hospital where you went for treatment. A written request should include your name, date of birth, social security number, and the specific information you are requesting.

You should also try to get letters of support from the following people:

- (1) Anyone who can say that they knew or suspected that you were battered;
- (2) Co-workers who witnessed bruises, health problems, or work absences resulting from battering, or heard stories about battering episodes;
- (3) Neighbors who heard or saw violent episodes or called the police in response to them;
- (4) Medical professionals who witnessed the results of battering, such as bruises or fear and anxiety;
- (5) Social workers who witnessed the effects of your battering;
- (6) Lawyers (in your criminal case or elsewhere) if they were aware of the battering and attempted to document its effects;
- (7) Experts consulted for trial regarding battered women’s syndrome and battering and its effects;
- (8) Witnesses who testified to the battering at trial;
- (9) Private investigators if one was hired for your case;
- (10) Women’s groups and community organizations. You can seek letters from groups that would support your clemency petition, such as battered women’s groups, women’s rights groups, prisoners’ groups, or any community group of which you are a member.

In addition to the documents described previously, you will want to obtain your DOCCS records (records concerning the time you have spent in prison), your parole file, and your case file. Your DOCCS records include:

- (1) All misbehavior reports and supplemental (additional) sheets;
- (2) Physical force and unusual incident sheets;
- (3) Adjustment committee reports and dispositions;
- (4) Copy of legal dates;
- (5) Crimes of commitment;
- (6) Personal history record;
- (7) Disciplinary record;
- (8) Correctional supervision history;
- (9) Certificates of program completion; and
- (10) Recognition letters

(d) Obtaining your DOCCS file, case record, parole file, case file and rap sheet

In order to obtain your DOCCS file, write to the inmate records coordinator of your facility with your name, DOCCS number, where you would like the records sent, and a list of the documents you want to receive. If the documents are being sent to someone other than you, you must authorize their release.

The case record is the most complete set of records maintained by the Board of Parole and can be obtained by writing to the senior parole officer of your facility with your name, ID number, and release interview date (or revocation hearing date or appeal pending date, whichever applies). State that you want to review all the information in the file that will be considered by the Board of Parole to prepare for the upcoming date.

The parole file is a less complete record in the central office, and it can be obtained by writing to the Chairman of the Board of Parole, 97 Central Avenue, Albany, NY 12206. State that you are requesting these records under FOIL and the New York Personal Privacy Protection Law (PPPL).

You should also obtain a copy of your case file, which includes police reports, hearing transcripts, and other useful information from your trial. Ask your attorney for copies of these documents and transcripts. If your attorney does not have complete transcripts, you may need to call the criminal courthouse to get copies.

For your rap sheet, send a written request to the New York State Division of Criminal Justice Services Civil Identification Bureau, 4 Tower Place, Albany, New York 12203. Prisoners should include their name, date of birth, social security number, and department identification number, and send the request in a

facility envelope, if possible. You can also ask them to *RUSH* processing of your file if you need the information quickly. Otherwise, it can take eight weeks or longer to receive your rap sheet. You also have a right to obtain pre-sentencing reports.¹⁴⁹ To get them, send a written request to the above address, addressed "To Whom It May Concern", with your name, birth date, indictment number, sentencing court, the address to which you would like the information sent, and a signed release authorizing another person to receive the information, if necessary.

G. Conclusion

Female prisoners are sometimes denied their legal rights while in prison. It is important for you to know your rights so you can take action to protect them. This Chapter explains in particular your right to receive the same programming as male prisoners, your right to adequate medical care, and your right to be free from sexual harassment or assault. It also explains your rights regarding searches and privacy, as well as how to file for clemency. This Chapter, which outlines many of the major problems that women face in prison, is meant to supplement the rest of the *JLM*, which discusses the rights of all prisoners and describes how to file grievances and bring lawsuits. If you need additional help, the organizations listed in Appendix A of this Chapter may be helpful to you.

149. N.Y. Crim. Proc. Law § 390.50 (McKinney's 2010).

APPENDIX A

CONTACTS FOR FURTHER ASSISTANCE

Resources in New York

Battered Women:

STEPS to End Family Violence
PO Box 287326,
New York, NY 10128
(646) 315-7600

The Domestic Violence Prosecution Hybrid Clinic at Albany Law School
80 New Scotland Avenue
Albany, NY 12208-3494
(518) 445-2328

Discharge Planning & Work Release:

Women's Prison Association
110 Second Avenue
New York, NY 10003
(646) 292-7740

Health Care:

The Legal Aid Society, Prisoners' Rights Project
199 Water Street
New York, NY 10038
(212) 577-3300

Sexual Harassment:

Prisoner's Legal Services
ITHACA
114 Prospect St.
Ithaca, NY 14850
(607) 273-2283

Prisoner's Legal Services
ALBANY
41 State Street, Suite M112
Albany, NY 12207

Women's Program Services:

Women's Advocacy Ministry, Inc.
211 West 129th Street
New York NY 10027
(212) 280-7320

General Questions:

Women in Prison Project
The Correctional Association of New York
2090 Adam Clayton Powell Blvd
Suite 200
New York, NY 10027
(212) 254-5700

National Resources Outside of New York:**Battered Women:**

National Clearinghouse for the Defense of Battered Women
125 S. 9th Street, Suite 302
Philadelphia, PA 19107
(215) 351-0010
(Accepts collect calls from incarcerated battered women)

National Coalition Against Domestic Violence
One Broadway, Suite B210
Denver, CO 80203
(303) 839-1852 or 1-800-799-SAFE (1-800-799-7233)

Health:

Cancer Hotline:
1-800-4CANCER (1-800-422-6237)

Sexual Assault and Rape:

Rape, Abuse, and Incest National Network
National Sexual Assault Hotline
1-800-656-HOPE (1-800-656-4673)
(Free and confidential, 24 hours a day)

General Information:

National Women's Law Center
Women in Prison Project
11 Dupont Circle, NW
Suite 800
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 588-5180